WELCOME BG TASK FORCE

REPORT & RECOMMENDATIONS:

Additional Attachments

June 2018
# Relevant Reports

## Table of Contents

1. Welcome BG Task Force Members  
   Page 3

2. Welcome Toledo/Lucas County Initiative - Notes, June 8, 2017  
   Page 4

3. “Building Global” A Public Presentation by Steve Tobocman, Director of Global Detroit... Consultation and Public Presentation—Summary Notes, November 2, 2017  
   Page 7

   Page 10

5. Welcoming America/Welcoming Economies 2017 Convening Report - Syracuse, NY, 2017  
   Page 12

6. Welcome Toledo/Lucas County (WTLC) Workforce and Economic Development Meeting Summary, April 9, 2018  
   Page 16

   Page 18

8. International Student Worker Retention – Barrier and Recommendations, March 22, 2018  
   Page 21

9. Joint Welcome BG and BGSU meeting summary, April 30, 2018  
   Page 24

10. “Building a More Welcoming City – A Community Conversation” Report, May 17, 2018  
    Page 28

11. Additional Resources  
    Page 36
WELCOME BG TASK FORCE

MEMBERS

(Alphabetical)

Sue Clark  Director, BG Economic Development

Bruce Jeffers  BG City Council Member

Mojabeng Kamala  Resident, Immigrant, Business Owner

Beatriz Maya  Director, LaConexion

Margaret Montague  Task Force Chair, BG Human Relations Commission Member

Dr. Louis Moreno  BGSU Dept. of Ethnic Studies / Chicano / Latino Studies

Dr. Margaret Weinberger  BGSU Department of Sociology

John Zanfardino  BG City Council Member
JUNE 8, 2017 - WELCOME TOLEDO-LUCAS COUNTY – NOTES

Present: Brittany Ford, Project Manager WTLC; John Zanfardino and Beatriz Maya (Welcome BG)

Highlights of discussion:

• **Most important thing**: pick a lane. The Welcoming initiatives cover many areas: cultural, social services, languages, legal, economic and workforce development, etc. You can’t do everything. Welcome TLC neglected the economic—workforce development benefits of welcoming immigrants and **this is the area they recommend us to focus on first**. Talking about our aging population, population loses, labor shortages and how welcoming immigrants can be a solution for all of this is the main message and the way to grab those who might not be on our side now. Show data on how much immigrants pay in taxes, contributions to social security, their spending power, how they start small businesses, buy property and revitalize neighborhoods. The understanding of the cultural/social benefits of welcoming immigrants will come after people understand the economic benefits.

• How and why did you get started?

Issues facing Toledo: Aging population; Population loses; vacant/neglected properties; worker recruitment and retention... They got information about the Dayton model. Conversations started in 2012. Formally launched in 2014. At the same time, US Toledo, a refugee resettlement organization, opened an office in Toledo. Organized 3 community discussions (PBS movie showing and discussion; East Toledo Community Center; and Sofia Quintero Cultural Center focus on Latinos) In 2015 Global Detroit assisted them in developing committee-base organizational structure. They also worked with Partnership for a New American Economy to produce a data report (this is free of charge—need to apply—application due in August)

• How are you funded?

Lucas County Commissioners $15,000 and Americorps $14,000. They are looking at raising more funds to have a full time person in charge

• What initiatives have you taken?

Focus areas: 1. Community outreach; 2. Legal Services (through ABLE. Commissioners fund ABLE at $50,000 currently); 3. Workforce and Economic Development and 4. Language Access---Activities have included: Cultural events, dinners, annual international film festival

• How are you organized and who is involved?
They recently worked with Global Detroit to develop the structure. They have a Steering Committee and Working Committees to address the focus areas (Community outreach; Legal Services; Workforce/Economic Development; and Language Access)

- How did you approach specific groups? Law enforcement, business community, etc.......what did you use to build momentum and get “buy in”? Which approaches worked and didn’t work?

Invited head of Global Detroit Steve Tobocman to make a pitch to businesses, Rotary, Chamber of Commerce ... Current business partners are Toledo Port Authority; Jobs Ohio; Toledo Chamber of Commerce

- Role of law enforcement

They have not done a lot of work with law enforcement yet. Recommended the work of Dayton.

- How did economics drive this? Worker shortages?

  Although this is a major factor, they neglected the work on this area. Now it is their major focus.

- Did you use media? and how?

  They decided to stay away from media for about a year until they could build enough support – Now they have been using the data they collected for messages and communication on aging population; population loses; brain drainage; contributions of immigrants to the economy

- Challenges, successes

  Positives: working with Global Detroit to develop structure and plan. Now they are more prepared to prioritize important work

  Building Steering Committee, working committees and partnerships --- Network partners: organizations or individuals who are not in their committees but with whom they work together. In this way you spread the work

    Having the data is important
Challenges: at the beginning they did a lot of cultural activities that were too time consuming and lost focus on the economic/workforce development aspect which for them is the most important. This is what resonates and what is important in the 21st century economy

- Affiliations - Regional, National networks

Welcoming Economies (WE) Global. This is the network that has been more useful for them. Lead by Global Detroit ….Focus on neighborhood revitalization, economic development, worker shortages/workforce development. Charge $200 membership but will give you stipends to go to conferences and so on that offset the cost. They have a conference in Syracuse in October, they recommend us sending reps

Welcoming America. Focus more on social/cultural aspects. Brittany thinks that the fee paid to We Global goes towards covering fee for Welcoming America but not sure.

- Recommends

To get in touch with the Center for Regional Development at BGSU (Will Burns) and a professor at the Geography Dept at BGSU who’s doing research on the contribution of immigrants to this area
NOVEMBER 2, 2018 – “Building Global” A Public Presentation
Steve Tobocman, Director of Global Detroit and leader of the Welcoming Economies Initiative—Wood County Public Library

Pre-Meeting with Steve Tobocman and the Welcome BG Task Force

- He asked, "What do we aspire to be as a community?" Create your own future.
- Important for BG to be prosperous 5-10 years from now.
- Need a skilled workforce and need to grow one to attract people and to attract new businesses
- Good schools attract people to a community.
- Small businesses are the backbone of the US downtowns
- Immigrants: (Based on research)
  - Housing critical.
    - Immigrants will buy up lower cost properties and fix them up for housing or their businesses
  - Work long hours
  - For millennials, immigrants create excitement and diversity around food, cultural events etc.,
  - Undocumented:
    - Fear census, which affects the data
    - Support services:
      - Free tax prep as important down the road for them to have filed.
      - IRS doesn't share info with Immigration Offices
- BGSU
  - What programs at the University can we leverage to support our city goals in this area?
  - What additional synergy is needed between the university and community to get international students to stay in BG? (Could be a question for Brittany...what has Toledo done in this regard?)
- Collaborating with Brittany about what T-LC is doing to see where we can collaborate would help us figure out where to start...so we don't reinvent the wheel if they have programs we can learn from, join etc.
- Think about becoming a member of "Welcoming America" to educate ourselves and our community about the economic benefits of embracing immigration. (See below for what this involves.)
Feedback from Tobocman Event:

- Overall input was that the information was well-presented...Steve's delivery and the data.
- Good first public presentation of the research, issues and what others are doing.
- Some hoped he would have shared more concrete recommendations about what our next steps should be.
- He put us on even ground, so now we have to determine what is next.
- Be careful about focusing only on the economic development issues; address social services, cultural events and human/labor rights aspects as well.
- Important for us to balance the Economic Development and Social/Cultural Events pieces.
- Liked T-LC events Brittany shared:
  - "Lunch and Learn" meetings that connects employers with lawyers who can help educate and advise on what they can do to hire immigrants.
  - Toledo's Intl Film Festival (TIFF) celebrating cultural diversity and international understanding through curated film, shared food, and performances. [https://www.facebook.com/events/1168895089850706/](https://www.facebook.com/events/1168895089850706/)
- Steve noted when Global Detroit started, they didn't know what to do.
  - Now there are toolkits on Welcoming American and Welcoming Economies websites that our task force can take advantage of.
- How can we raise the visibility of what the Task Force is doing so people know?

Welcoming America Membership Commitment (from their website) as we consider in future if this is something we want to propose the City do.

- Membership Commitment You are joining a network of nonprofit organizations and municipal governments across the United States that are interested in making their communities more welcoming to immigrants and refugees. Through our network, we hope that you will improve your practice and share what you learn with others.

- Membership Principles As a Welcoming America member, we resolve to:
  - Support a vision in which all people, including immigrants, have the opportunity to reach their greatest potential, engage with their community, and fully contribute their talents – expanding prosperity and wellbeing for all.
  - Engage both immigrants and receiving community members, as their voices are critical to defining a welcoming agenda.
Work to build greater understanding, particularly among people who may have concerns about or are unaware of the changing demographics of their community.

Believe that people of all backgrounds have unique talents that can be brought to bear to make our communities vibrant, and welcoming efforts should be as inclusive as possible to all groups.

Operate with the conviction that better decisions are reached when multiple backgrounds and perspectives are meaningfully engaged, and strive to create an equitable and collaborative environment in which differences are embraced and harnessed to achieve the best results.

Believe leaders can play a catalytic role by recognizing, rewarding, and investing in community partners who are essential to building a community’s capacity for this work.

Value and recognize the importance of multi sector collaboration.

As a Welcoming America Member, we commit to:

- Follow general membership principles & doing local, community-focused work
- Participate in National Welcoming Week
- Pay dues to support the network and all groups and organizations within it
- Have at least one key staff contact
- Fill-out an annual members survey
- Collaborate with other members in their area/region
JANUARY 26, 2018 – Meeting with Refugee agency US Together
TOLEDO

Attendees: Sue Clark and Margaret Montague

Founded by refugees for refugees and is staffed by refugees. Its purpose is to:

- To coordinate, organize, and initiate services to immigrants and refugees through education, advocacy, support services, information, referrals, and networking opportunities in order to strengthen the community that we live in.

- As a 501(c)(3) respond to the needs of refugees and immigrants in central Ohio.

- As a Refugee Resettlement Agency and an affiliate of the Hebrew Immigrant Aid Society, we accept cases from all over the world that are forced to seek refuge in another country due to the inability to stay in their native country.

- Services are provided through our Columbus, Cleveland and Toledo offices to hundreds of nationalities that are starting their new lives in the United States. Through all interactions, we strive to keep in accordance with our mission.

- There are four service goals to resettle refugees:
  - Basic Needs
  - Health Access
  - Social Integration
  - Self-sufficiency through Economic Integration (employment, education)

Agenda: To share about BG's labor shortages in the manufacturing sector and learn if there are any areas US Together of collaboration for mutual benefit.

Key Takeaways:

- The State Dept provides 3 months support from the moment of arrival until getting them up and running on their own (Makes my head spin just thinking about this!)
  - Find and set up housing/utilities
  - Official docs (SS, driver's license etc)
  - Kids in school
  - Health care
  - Prepare for job search
Sample Skills:

- Tile layers
- Carpenters
- Tailor

Challenges/Realities: (Most have been raised in our TF)

- Language
  - They begin ESL classes immediately, but the reality is the time it takes to get up to speed.
  - At the moment, most are Arabic-speaking (Syria, Iraq)
- Transport to the job location
- With a livable wage, people will work
- Housing:
  - US Together says they have a few landlords who have found that the refugees referred to them are responsible to pay on time and well maintain the property. Thus, when they have vacancies, they now call US Together to see if anyone needs housing.

Next Steps:

- Collaborate with them on a pilot project to place a refugee in a BG manufacturing (mfg) job.
- Sue
  - Will talk to a couple of HR Managers in the BG mfg sector about what languages might be available already within the company so someone could be available if needed.
  - Will see if any transport arrangements from Toledo might be an option to eliminate the driving costs/difficulties.
  - Will check if the possibility of getting a grant to fund a temporary "job coach" to help the employee get up to speed.
- Identify a local landlord who might collaborate with BG on this pilot.
“Building bridges for economic inclusion”

(Welcome BG Task Force representative Mojabeng Khamala participated in this conference with the Welcome Toledo-Lucas County delegation and produced this report)

The fate of U.S workers in the Great Lakes region has become a centerpiece of the national conversation on the economy. Politicians have capitalized on economic frustrations, arguing that immigrants are to blame for the region’s woes.

The reality, however, is that far from being the cause of its economic struggles, immigration may in fact provide one of the most promising solutions to it. The findings of a new report by New American Economy and the Great Lakes Metro Chambers Coalition shows how immigrants are reviving and strengthening industries like manufacturing and healthcare; offsetting decades of population decline; and reinvigorating local economies with the new businesses, an increased tax base and consumer spending that drives local growth.

The Welcome Economies conference compiled participants from 10 regional states – IA, IL, IN, MI, MN, MO, NY, OH, PA and WI. It was packed with information, sharing of policies, ideas and programs aimed at harnessing the “economic, social and cultural power of New Americans” (Robert Simpson).

The shortage of the work force as it impacts the local economy and population decline are not unique to BG but the good news is that like most cities across the country, we can do something about it. The untapped and under utilized solution lies in immigrant population that My report will quote a lot of data, numbers and percentages – intentionally so as it was emphasized that it is one true and irrefutable way to paint the picture of the contribution of immigrants in our country, states and cities.

Who is the immigrant?

For our purposes, the immigrant is the foreign born in this country including international students, refugees, asylees, and the undocumented.

How do immigrants power the US economic growth?

-28% of main street business owners every 10 private sector workers in the country
-Immigrants account for 48% if overall growth in business ownership
-24.3% of engineering and technology companies had at least immigrant founder. These companies produced $63 billion in sales and employing more than 560,000 workers
-Immigrants have started more than half of America’s start-up companies valued at $1 billion or more.
How do these numbers translate in this region?
The following are the findings of the New American Economy and the Great Lakes Metro Chambers Coalition.

Immigration fuels population growth:
-immigrants accounted for half of regional population growth between 2000 and 2015, offsetting population decline altogether in 9 of the top 25 metros

Immigrants are keeping the region’s workforce viable:
-more than 70% of the region’s immigrants were working –age in 2015 compared to only 51% of the US born

Immigrants are bringing much needed talent to the region:
-35% of immigrants ages 25 and above has at least a bachelor’s degree compared to just 29% of the US born and between 2010 and 2015, more than half of the net growth in the working age immigrant population came from those with a bachelor’s degree or higher
-immigrants fill the higher skilled jobs that allow companies to stay local
-foreign-born workers made up one of 1 of every seven manufacturing engineering in 2015

Immigrants have played a critical role powering the region’s booming healthcare sector:
-immigrants helped drive supersized growth in the region’s healthcare industry
-despite representing just 7.3% of the region’s population, immigrants made up 27% of physicians and surgeons in 2015

Immigrants are helping the region meet its rising labor demand in agriculture:
-by taking on some of the labor-intensive farm jobs that are less attractive to US born workers, immigrants help the agriculture sector thrive
-immigrants made up 1 out of every 4 miscellaneous farmworkers in the region in 2015 – workers that include those harvesting crops by hand in the fields.

Immigrants play a particularly large role in the region as entrepreneurs:
-main street businesses owned by immigrants created nearly 240,000 working class jobs for US born workers between 2000 and 2015
-immigrants made up more than 1 of every 10 entrepreneurs in the region in 2015

Immigrants’ spending power has helped revitalize local businesses:
-in 2015, immigrants held close to $130billion in spending power; that made up 8.2% of the region’s total spending power, even though immigrants represented just 7.3% of the region’s overall population

How to create Welcoming City?
Community Engagement Is KEY -- Who is at the roundtable?
-community organizations and service providers (assist with various services eg: resume writing, job application process, networking)
-private and public sector employers (employers with open positions and willing to hire immigrants or refugees but who will also require support in integrating the new employees into their organization effectively)
-government organizations (at all levels to lend legitimacy and offer advise on available programs)
-educational institutions and education related organization (provide credential related services; language access, etc)
-Regional chambers and industry association (that can speak to economic development and labour market need on behalf of industry players who are facing talent shortages)

Once these key players understand their roles, the residents have to be engaged. It was found that the residents can be educated on the benefits of immigrants when they hear from people they respect and people in leadership positions. We are talking the mayor, city council, principals, school superintendent, church pastors, companies’ HR directors etc.

The objective of community engagement is to INFORM, INVOLVE AND INVEST. The goal of every engagement opportunity is highlighting the contributions of immigrants – their level of education (not every immigrant is uneducated; an accent does not equal not knowing English) this is where the importance of figures and data is crucial – because they provide evidence indicating immigrant entrepreneurs and their value to local economy. Where possible, showcase the significance of immigrant owned businesses; have testimonials of the “success story”

Be ready to hear each concern, fear and sometimes outright incorrect information; but it is important that each is heard and given the platform to have his/her voice heard. Listening and correcting the myths and giving the right information will be ongoing. As much as this was geared towards immigrants, it was important that it was not just about them but also about everyone; it’s inclusion for everyone as we will live side by side and work side by side.

For employers, it is important talking to other employers who have first hand experience in hiring immigrants and hearing their success stories. There are employers who are open to hiring immigrants but unfortunately there are a lot of myths attached to hiring immigrants.

How to approach an employer with hiring immigrants:
-let them identify the vacancies they desire to fill
-offer someone who can fill those vacancies who just happens to be an immigrant
-organize job fairs so they can meet them in a “safe” or comfortable zone

Why do they hesitate?
-not understanding immigration laws is the big factor
*types of visas
*it will cost them money for the work visas
*language barrier and cultural
*licensing professions – equating qualifications; verifying credentials (Canada – WES will do a pilot in the US)

*want to hire people that will blend in and yet for the companies that want to grow, they hire immigrants because they bring in different perspectives and solutions;
*for companies that want to grow beyond their shores, they hire immigrants because they have a world view and international networks and resources

International students are another untapped pool to our economy growth.

Once we have hired the immigrants, we have to retain them. The immigrants in our communities bring valuable insight with their diverse cultural backgrounds; they tend to be loyal and highly motivated. This is where being the welcoming city is crucial. When they get off work, they have to feel safe, part of the community, their children at school adjusting well.

Benefits:
- economy (in supporting the immigrant entrepreneurs, we grow a strong and healthy local economy; immigrants will stay longer with their companies – less turn over)
- revitalize neighborhoods (traits we care least about, they care most about – they see opportunities in getting an old house and renovating it; abandoned building as store front; international festivals held in their neighborhoods eg Toledo international film festival
- cultural diversity (appreciate the immigrants as assets)
- welcoming city (where all people feel they belong and not just tolerated; ensure long stay; )

So what does a welcoming BG look like?

An action plan has to be in place:

1. **Action step/task** (what strategy will we implement)
2. **Goal** (what is the goal of that strategy)
3. **Timeline** (what is our timeframe)
4. **Partners** (who will we bring on board)
5. **Resources** (what resources do we need? Financial, data, messages, stories)
6. **Communication** (how will we communicate action step with partners and community)
7. **Success criteria** (how will we identify our success)
April 9, 2018 - Welcome Toledo/Lucas County Workforce and Economic Development Meeting – Toledo, OH

Attended by Sue Clark, Mojabeng Kamala, and Margaret Montague

Goals: are in these areas:

- Entrepreneurship
- Workforce and Economic Development
- Employer Engagement

Quick Wins/Action Items: Working on these:

- Entrepreneur Toolkit for Immigrants and Refugees
  - Basic Rights
  - Preparation to be a business owner and how to launch a new business (Financial Mgt.; permits/licenses/Mktg/technology)
  - Will translate into different languages
- 1 pager on hiring International talent - working with UT International Student Office
- UT Job Fair to bring employers to the relevant job seekers rather than the other way around.
- Guide for attracting/retaining International talent - working with UT on this
- Working on partnership with Associated General Contractors on workforce development

Resources:

- Global Talent Retention Initiative (Michigan)
  - http://www.migtri.org "Retention is the best attraction"

GTRI focuses on strengthening and diversifying the state’s economy through the retention of top international talent. By retaining international students, GTRI is a catalyst to lessening the skills gap in the STEM fields especially, and cultivating a climate in which Michigan businesses can be competitive in the new economy. GTRI provides international students and local employers with training and resources on relevant immigration regulations, information on finding a job in Michigan, and help with cross-cultural issues that both employers and international applicants may experience during the hiring process.
GTRI collaborates with the Michigan Governor’s office, the Office for New Americans, Global Detroit, over 30 Michigan Universities, the University Research Corridor (URC), the American Immigration Lawyers Association (AILA), Michigan’s economic development agencies, ethnic chambers, professional organizations, and employers throughout the state.

- **St. Louis Mosaic Project**: [https://www.stlmosaicproject.org/](https://www.stlmosaicproject.org/)

The St. Louis Mosaic Project is a regional initiative within the St. Louis Economic Development Partnership and the World Trade Center St. Louis. St. Louis aims to be a cultural mosaic because this community believes that immigrants invigorate our region. We want to share our community with its great neighborhoods, outstanding schools, plus some of the best hospitals and cultural destinations in the world.

**Immigrant Service Resource:**

Immigrant Ecosystem Map
[https://www.stlmosaicproject.org/st-louis-international-resources.html](https://www.stlmosaicproject.org/st-louis-international-resources.html)
(Courtesy of STL New American Alliance – [https://newamericanalliance.org/](https://newamericanalliance.org/))

International Institute

Mosaic Project
[https://www.stlmosaicproject.org/](https://www.stlmosaicproject.org/)

Hispanic Chamber of Commerce
[https://www.hccstl.com/](https://www.hccstl.com/)

Asian Chamber of Commerce

Casa de Salud
[https://casadesaludstl.org/](https://casadesaludstl.org/)
WELCOME BOWLING GREEN TASK FORCE REPORT ON IMMIGRANT ENTREPRENEURS

GROUP AREA: Economic Development  
FOCUS: Small Business Owners  
PARTICIPANTS: Immigrant business owners in Bowling Green

Despite accounting for only about thirteen percent of the population, immigrants start more than a quarter of businesses in the U.S. Twenty percent of the 2014 Inc 500 CEOs are immigrants. Their companies pay an estimated $126 billion in wages per year and employ one in ten Americans who work for private companies. Their businesses generated more than $775 billion in sales. (1)

These documented statistics should provide the importance of dispelling the notion that immigrants take away American jobs. On the contrary, immigrant-run businesses contribute to the economic growth, social inclusion for cities and regions, thus attracting new residents. Immigrant entrepreneurship creates jobs, revitalize declining neighborhoods, innovate and integrate other immigrants into the labor market.

As with other cities nationwide, Bowling Green can utilize and benefit from immigrant entrepreneurs in addressing the current labor shortage.

FINDINGS:
In meeting with immigrant business owners, one cannot miss the enthusiasm and pride in owning a business and still acknowledge the barriers that they have faced and continue to face as immigrant entrepreneurs in Bowling Green. This report includes findings from interviews to owners who have been in business for several years and others much less. Further indicated that they love BG and the family that surrounds them came to BG because they found it welcoming and safe.

BARRIERS:
These barriers prevent not just BG’s but immigrant entrepreneurs nationwide from realizing full potential of their enterprises to contribute to the socioeconomic welfare and competitiveness of host country.

Lack of funding: (start up or expansion): In one case, the business has been fully funded by a loan from family overseas. Looking for loans/funding locally (which in turn would have brought business for the local banks) wasn’t an option. Even with that, they can only receive the money in increments as regulated by the Federal Banking Regulations.
**Immigration status.** For international students who might want to start a business, a student visa poses other barriers as well. For an example, they can legally be a business owner but cannot legally employ self or family members because of their visas.

**Lack of resources.** i.e. immigration lawyers and local networking presented additional struggles.

**Shorter (if any) credit history:** denial of loans and tighter financial constraints

No collateral: This potentially results in higher interest rates than native-born

**Lack full mastery the country’s business “language’**

**Lack of knowledge of local business systems:** permits, licensing, social security obligations etc

**Lack of networks:** mentors or resources

**Difficulty in obtaining credit and establishing credit history** is much harder as an immigrant. They shared that for their very first car, someone who had taken them under his wing co-signed for them; which helped in creating the history that later enabled securing the business loan.

**Lack of cultural events** in the community played a huge role in the immigrants’ discomfort in BG.

**Lack of education about the contribution of immigrants** by the community, businesses and social services is another drawback. They feel this contributes to the lack of patronage of their business (or for some who don’t seem to know their business exists in town after so many years).

**It is also important to note that these barriers are not unique to Bowling Green.**

**SUGGESTED SOLUTIONS:**

1. Educate the community of the contribution of immigrants in the local and nationwide economies
2. Educate the banks, land lords, local government entities, social services of the benefits of the immigrants
3. Resource center specifically for aspiring immigrant entrepreneurs – at minimum have someone in the already available resource centers who is widely versed in immigrants’ barriers
4. Knowledge based services

**RECOMMENDATIONS FOR BG:**

1. Sponsor cultural/welcoming-themed events by the city – (independent of BGSU events) that demonstrate that it is a welcoming city. Welcome TLC has these events for an example; African American History or Heritage Month, International Women’s Day, Arab American Heritage month, Asian Pacific Islander Heritage month, Immigrant Heritage month, World Refugee Day, National Welcoming Week, Hispanic/Latino/x Heritage month, Native American Heritage month.
2. Support events promoted by the immigrant businesses in town
3. Establish a city program providing detailed explanation and steps of business system. It needs to be staffed by specifically trained staff in the “barrier” areas.
4. Resource center /targeted support for (a) knowledge-based services (b) tailored counseling and assistance (c) mentoring and networking (d) facilitate access to credit
5. In each of the already available services, ensure that at least one staff member is thoroughly trained in areas specifically impacting immigrant entrepreneurs
6. Establish long term need policies
7. Mainstream and targeted business support program
8. Structural and broader policies that promote an environment that is conducive to entrepreneurship and innovation.

Resources: (1) *The Most Entrepreneurial group in America wasn’t born in America. Inc.* Adam Bluestein 2016
MARCH 22, 2018 - INTERNATIONAL STUDENT WORKER RETENTION – BARRIERS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Part I. Process that needs to be followed by International students to come to the USA and to find a job after graduation:

1. Upon admission to the school and a successful interview at a U.S. Embassy/Consulate in their country, international students receive an F-1 visa. They have to be full-time students and are not allowed to work off-campus for professional experience (Exceptions may be made based on each case).

2. 90 days before their graduation date, international students need to apply for a temporary work authorization called Optional Practical Training (OPT). This work authorization is only valid for 12 months and can be extended for STEM majors (Science, Technology, Engineering & Math) to up to 24 months.

3. After the OPT period, to remain in the U.S. as an international worker, a student must find an employer who is willing to file for an H1-B visa on his/her behalf. According to USCIS, “the H-1B program allows companies in the United States to temporarily employ foreign workers in occupations that require the theoretical and practical application of a body of highly specialized knowledge and a bachelor’s degree or higher in the specific specialty, or its equivalent.”

4. After being on H1-B Visa for up to 6 years, a former international student must find an employer who is willing to offer them a position that qualifies under an employment-based green card. Employers must prove that no U.S. worker with the desired qualifications is available for the position.

A large number of the international students who graduate from American universities wish to stay and work in the U.S. They may contribute to solving the problem of lack of workers in some areas. According to online resources, around 800 international students are currently enrolled at Bowling Green State University and 1500 are enrolled in the university of Toledo. However, these graduates face many barriers to find an employment opportunity. This document attempts to provide background on some of the barriers to hiring international students as well as some suggested solutions.

Part II: Potential Barriers to hiring international students

1. The H1B filing fees are very high:
   a. In addition to the base filing fee ($460), the following fees are added:
   b. American Competitiveness and Workforce Improvement Act of 1998 (ACWIA) fee: $750 for employers with 1 to 25 full-time equivalent employees, unless exempt, OR
$1,500 for employers with 26 or more full-time equivalent employees, unless exempt
c. Fraud Prevention and Detection fee: $500.
d. Public Law 114-113 fee: $4,000 for petitioners who employ 50 or more employees in the United States and when more than 50% of those employees are in H-1B or L-1 nonimmigrant status.

In summary, depending on the size of the company, the H1B filing fee can vary anywhere from $1,600 USD to $7,400 USD + the Attorney fee (if any).

2. Employers are required by law to pay ALL the sponsorship fees based on the H1B Online Advisor Tool by US Department of Labor (DOL)

3. The sponsorship might take a very long time. Also workers may have weeks off waiting for renewal.

4. H1B status can be extended to up to 6 years, then employees need to file for permanent residence. At this point, they need to prove that no U.S. worker is available for the position. It involves a long process and a lot of paperwork.

5. Companies may have little or no experience hiring non-U.S. workers, so they prefer to avoid the trouble. Some anticipated problems include communication issues and cultural differences

Part III: Suggested solutions: (colleges or community level)

1. Educate employers (managers and HR staff) on the benefits and the process of hiring international students (investing in H1B visas) through fliers, webinars, conferences, and social and networking events.

2. Local recruiting and staffing agencies can assist linking students with employers.

3. Local cultural organizations and houses of worship may reach out to companies and invite them to celebrations and festivals to create bridges and encourage the companies to recognize and embrace diversity.

4. Create workshops for international students to provide information on how to apply for jobs and how to market their skills.

5. Community lawyers may be encouraged to donate their time to help international students on H1B applications.

6. Encourage creating international student online groups where H1B seekers help each other and share experiences.
Resources:


https://redbus2us.com/new-h1b-online-advisor-tool-by-us-department-of-labordol/


http://www.immi-usa.com/from-h1b-to-green-card-process-eb2-or-eb3-visa/


APRIL 30, 2018 – JOINT “WELCOME BG” AND BGSU MEETING
SUMMARY

Attendees:

- Human Relations Commission: Mary Jane Saunders (Chair); Margaret Montague (Member)
- Welcome BG Task Force: Beatriz Maya, Mojabeng Kamala, Sue Clark, Margaret Montague
- NIOT - Steering Committee: Julie Broadwell, Christina Lunceford
- City of Bowling Green: Heather Sayler (also with NIOT)
- BGSU Office of Diversity and Inclusion: Christina Lunceford
- United Way - Sue Clanton
- CVB - Wendy Chambers

(Gary Saunders and Holly Cipriani unable to attend)
Thank you for participating in this meeting to brief each other about initiatives in the City and at BGSU that share some common goals, to learn more about the work of the Welcome BG Task Force and then see where we might collaborate and support each other as it makes sense to promote a Welcoming environment.

BGSU Office of Diversity and Inclusion:

- Key area of focus: Attract and Retain students, faculty and staff
  - Traditional college student enrollment declining
  - Students of color increasing
  - Working with students early on about a career path to follow
- Interns are available if the work they do is related to their degree program.
  - Christy will pitch having one for the Welcome BG support - research what other Welcoming Cities with BG’s profile are doing, consolidating information, identifying possible grants for this work, Website/Facebook Page. Will let us know if this is approved.
- A Diversity and Inclusion page is on the BG calendar to highlight related events
- Dr. Rodgers has spoken of the importance to students of "Belonging" (to both the university and city communities) and they are working on addressing this. Aligns with Welcome BG
CVB:

- CVB and BGSU Intl Programs collaborated on a scavenger hunt in downtown BG for new intl students. Big success.
- City Guide and Visitors’ Guide publications
- Working on a branding campaign. Aligns with Welcome BG Visibility goals.

UNITED WAY:

- Continuum of Care provides support to homeless in our community.

CITY:

- Hosting the Town and Gown Assoc meeting in July

NIOT:

- The programs around addressing hate and intolerance compete with the university, so not well attended

WELCOME BG:

- Finalizing recommendations in 2 key areas: Economic Opportunities and Livability
- May 17 - Community Conversation at Public Library - 6-7:30 pm. Have a panel to share the Welcome BG Task Force initiative, process, draft recommendations and get their input. Mayor will introduce. There will be a table for relevant information from the City, if you have something to bring.

Issues/Challenges/Barriers:

- Schools:
  - Some kids have been teased about their skin color and their hair. One parent had to ultimately remove the child to another school.
  - Bullying continues in the schools
  - Ensure teachers have the training to recognize and deal with incidents of discrimination in the classroom.
  - Have a Diversity and Inclusion Committee
- People from diverse racial and ethnic backgrounds still express they don't feel welcome in BG. While there are activities, they don't find an openness to engage. One exception was noted: Literacy in the Park event. Drew people from diverse backgrounds and good engagement. (Important for Mayor Edwards and Dr. Rodgers to be aware of this. What steps can be taken to understand/explore this further?)

- English proficiency and different accents is a recurring theme with employers, residents, businesses - harder to engage
  - Interpretation services now available for BG Police, Cocoon and the intake unit of the hospital. Once patients are admitted, no interpretation services.
  - Need to institutionalize ESL classes that are currently offered by La Conexion and Global Connections.

- Need a visual representation of services available so newcomers can easily know where to go for what. "Come be a part of the Community"

- Need a 24/7 hotline for Human Relations type issues
  - Currently the BG web page says to email the HRC Chair. But if it's a weekend or the person is gone, no back up.
  - BGSU has a monitored site; can be anonymous: "See It ; Hear It; Report It" - [https://www.bgsu.edu/student-affairs/report-it.html](https://www.bgsu.edu/student-affairs/report-it.html)
  - Newcomers can be reluctant to call the police.
  - Not sure of LINK services at this point.

- Housing: Finding affordable housing in BG is difficult for newcomers in mid to low income groups. Lots of barriers (credit, inventory etc)

- Transportation to BG for those living outside is an issue for low income workers. No public options for those without vehicles; costly to drive back and forth.

- Collaboration on new BG Branding Campaign to infuse "Welcome" message

**Upcoming Opportunities to build upon and increase BG's visibility as a Welcoming City:**

- **Firefly evenings** (3rd Friday from May-August) - Opportunity to mingle downtown - music, food, street closed off with tables/chairs available. How can this highlight diversity and inclusion?

**Ideas: (just the beginning!)**
• Hold a "Welcome BG" event at the City Park - again opportunity to mingle
• A Welcoming Ambassador Program - connecting newcomers with a resident to help them navigate the systems
• A website to help those relocating
• Best of BG - July 19 4:30-6:30 at Simpson Garden - Have a Welcome BG Table - Ohio Town and Gown Assoc invited as they will be in town. (CVB)

**Key Takeaways:**

• Increased understanding of what is taking place in various corners around supporting a Welcoming community.
• BGSU - Christy will pitch for an intern we can use for special projects that relate the the interns study area. As Diversity and Inclusion Director for BGSU, she would like to meet on a regular basis to keep building on this connection.
• See the attached "Template for Collaborating/Increasing awareness of various initiatives/events/groups. Please complete for each initiative from your group and return to Margaret to consolidate and share by May 25
Opening Remarks:
The opening remarks from Rev. Mary Jane Saunders and Mayor Richards Edwards gave an overview of the passage of the resolution, and the decision by Mayor Edwards and the Human Relations Commission to create the Welcome BG Task Force to help create recommendations on how the city can best live up the ideals put forth in the resolution.

The Welcome BG Task Force, chaired by Margaret Montague, included volunteers from across a variety of areas in the Bowling Green Community – drawing from local government, charitable organizations, and economic development organizations. Over the past year, the Task Force has worked to research ideas and strategies used by other communities, as well as studying the current needs and values of the Bowling Green Community.

As they present these draft recommendations, they have focused in on three primary goals:

1) To foster existing initiatives that already help promote Bowling Green as a welcoming, safe, and inclusive community for all residents, including immigrants.
2) To develop new initiatives and strategies to help improve the welcoming spirit and make the community more livable for immigrants and other diverse peoples.
3) To attract and retain workers from the immigrant community and other diverse populations to fill unmet worker shortages.

Final recommendations will include the community feedback received at this discussion and will be presented to the Human Relations Commission later this year, and ultimately to Major Edwards.

Chair Margaret Montague
Margaret spoke on the imperatives identified in our community which are creating many of our current challenges. Based on the numbers from the 2000 and 2010 U.S. Census, there was a clear shift in the local population in two key areas: Age and Race. While the Bowling Green area experiences a slight increase in population over this 10-year period, the white population went down by 3.7%. Comparatively, the populations of communities of color increased by nearly 50%. This means that nearly all of 1.25% population growth came from individuals of color. There has also been a dramatic increase in the retirement age population, which grew by 17% over the same period, while the working age population remained roughly the same.
Ultimately, this shows that as a community, that even while local businesses are thriving and looking to expand, the pool of working age individuals is not keeping pace with the current needs, creating a challenge to Economic Opportunity in the region.

Because of these findings the Welcome BG Task Force saw a need to focus their recommendations around two key interconnected areas: Economic Opportunity and Increasing Livability in the community. Overall, there is clearly a need to attract working age people to the community in order to ensure that local employers and prospective businesses can find the talent they need to succeed. But in order to do that, we must create a welcoming, safe, and inclusive environment in which they can thrive.

**Sue Clark**

Sue Clark reported that in her position, she knows that nearly all of NW Ohio is currently experiencing a shortage and mismatch of the workers. Within a 20 miles radius of Bowling Green, there are over 9,200 current job openings, with the potential addition of over 1,000 more with the recently announced expansions of First Solar and the Walgreens Distribution center. In addition, in a survey conducted by her organization, nearly 30% of employers who responded to the survey expressed that they intended to increase the number of positions available over the next year.

During her presentation, Sue shared that local businesses are reporting a strong economy and that many are looking to expand and actively working to hire and retain workers but are struggling with varying success. She introduced Dee Meyer, a hiring manager with Rosenboom, who expressed that they were currently working to fill 20-25 job openings, but that while they were getting candidates every day, they were not getting the skilled workforce they need. The company is making efforts to train people on these skills but finds that they struggle to retain these individuals and for every seven to ten she brings in, she will lose 2-4 more per week. They also expect to be expanding operations over the next few years, increasing their workforce by an additional 30-40 positions on top of the ones that currently remain unfilled.

The key recommendations in this area of increasing economic opportunity centered around finding ways to connect employers to existing labor pools that are currently going untapped, including millennials, immigrants, refugees, and other diverse populations. She also believes that creating resources that help to overcome barriers to increasing the number of documented workers in the area will be important as many employers find the challenge of navigating visas and sponsorships daunting. There is also a need to develop and further encourage co-ops and internships which help BGSU students, particularly international
students, develop the connections with the local economy which can help retain more of them in our area.

The final step will include finding ways to encourage and support local immigrant businesses and micro-businesses. There a variety of examples in other communities to draw upon. These types of businesses help increase diversity in local experiences and services and can help drive interest in our community.

Ultimately, while international students, immigrants, and refugees are not the only solution to our local labor shortages, they are an untapped pool with the labor force that Sue believes will give us a healthy start.

Bruce Jeffers

Bruce presented recommendations that connect with increasing the livability of our community. Many of recommendations will work hand and hand with the Community Action Plan that is already in progress.

In terms of housing, Bowling Green has several local challenges. There is a need to help diversify the offering in the current market – including both on the edges of town and closer to downtown. In attracting immigrants to the community, one of the biggest challenges, beyond pure pricing, is that many immigrants come without an established credit history, making it difficult to access housing at any price point as this is considered a major factor in lending and leasing decisions. There are efforts currently underway with local landlords to help establish alternative methods of verification for those who are facing a credit deficiency. Bruce also stressed that as we work to increase the amount of affordable housing, there must be an effort to ensure that with safety and quality doesn’t suffer.

Transportation is perhaps the most difficult area of livability that the community has struggled with for quite some time. There have been discussions of bus service, but given the size of the community, both public and private options don’t seem to have the volume required for viability. The availability of taxi service is one asset that Bowling Green offers that is rarely available in towns of our size, but it’s not a full solution. ODOT is aware of the local desire to develop public transportation options, but at this time, a solid option has not yet been identified.

Public safety is also a key to creating a livable community for all residents. It’s important to note that the city doesn’t intend to subvert national priorities, but they do want to ensure that the local police prioritizes public safety, not immigration enforcement. The Bowling Green Police Department, under Chief Hetrick, has worked to train and certify their officers in combatting
profiling to positive outcomes already. Continuing to ensure this focus on public safety and avoiding bias is essential to ensuring that all members of the community feel safe communicating and reporting to the local police, whether they are victims of a crime or a witness.

**Dr. Christina Lunceford**

BGSU continues to be a major contributing factor in the overall fabric of our community. It attracts many people to our city both to work and to study. As a public institution, BGSU sees addressing and responding to the public good as part of its mission. This includes responding to changing public needs, demographics, and economic factors.

Immigrants and international students and faculty play an important role at BGSU for a variety of reasons. International people bring money to the university as they often pay outright, rather than through scholarships, grants, and other resources. Their varied backgrounds and experiences also help enrich the culture of the University, bringing experiences and connections that help develop globally competent graduates who can connect across cultures and borders.

During the most recent Campus Climate Survey, for which data has been collected but the final analysis has not yet been completed, the University heard about an array of challenges in the local community. This included students and faculty reporting incidents of intolerance and bullying in the local schools as well as in the community at large. They also found that a high number of respondents had considered leaving the community over the last year.

Looking at these results, BGSU recognizes that retention is going to remain a challenge – particularly among those diverse populations that they are looking to grow. The culture of campus is directly tied to the community it exists in and that is why BGSU feels that building on the aspirations created by the Welcoming Resolution will be key in ensuring the university’s future success.

Internally, BGSU is looking to improve these measures through actively recruiting a more diverse faculty and administration. They are also looking at ways to partner with the community to help develop local community to help establish connections with graduates that will encourage them to set remain in Bowling Green after graduation. This includes creating more programs that will meet the needs of the current economy – certificate programs and standalone classes that can enhance career development.

Ultimately Christina reminded everyone that the passage of this resolution marks a goal to keep working towards. She believes that this aspiration to become a place of diversity and inclusion
which values that diverse background of community members will be key to the future success of our local economy and to the university.

Public Conversation
This portion of the report has been organized into areas of concern, rather than chronologically, to help ensure that areas of commonality are addressed and connected. Written responses were integrated into the spoken discussion points, as they often expanded topics already touched on.

Addressing Issues of Systemic Racism, Stereotypes, Harassment, and Bullying
Several respondents brought up specific incidents in which they were made to feel unwelcome, unwanted, or harassed in our community. This included the presence of a lawn jockey on private property on Haskins Rd., the use of racial slurs and derogatory comments in public places, being profiled as potential shoplifters while visiting local businesses (Walmart, Meijer, and Kroger were all named as being particularly at fault in these cases), as well as incidents of bullying and harassment in our public schools. If people of color and immigrants are to feel welcome in our community, these incidents can be harmful to our community’s overall image. While those responding still said that they felt connected to the community and even loved it, these incidents perpetrated by individuals can have a lasting impact on how welcoming and inclusive our community feels.

In response to these comments, Christina Lunceford spoke of an effort that Not In Our Town had discussed about bringing together community conversation on topics around racism, bullying, stereotypes, and cultural understanding. While these would largely end up “preaching to the choir”, these opportunities can filter out through the attendees to friends and family and ultimately bring changes to our culture. Others suggested that it would be important to bring education of this type to young people – through both public and parochial schools.

Others also pointed out that there was a real need to increase the diversity in local leadership and organizations. One respondent commented that it was rare for her to see other people of color participating in local cultural and educational opportunities – yoga classes, offerings at local parks, etc – or as part of local government. These types of activities are so much a part of daily life that drawing more diversity into these activities and programs will help increase the visibility of minorities and people of color.
Christina Lunceford expanded on her earlier point that BGSU is currently putting increasing diversity at the forefront as it makes plans. This includes efforts to increase representation of diverse peoples in faculty and administration, as well as in the student body itself. Other members of the audience also pointed out that BG City Schools is also currently making a
deliberate effort to diversify their own teaching staff to better represent their student body and to bring new perspectives to students.

Another suggestion to help improve issues of profiling and stereotypes was to help bring trainings and education to local employers, both on how to improve diversity among their own employees and on how to welcome diverse peoples to their businesses, as both of these things could help dramatically improve the use of profiling.

**Transportation**
The need for public transportation options has long been a desire among many in the Bowling Green community. A volunteer from La Conexión pointed out that one of the biggest barriers to immigrants in the community is transportation – the cost of owning a car, insuring it, as well as fuel costs can be extremely prohibitive for many families starting out. For those in the undocumented community, obtaining a license to drive is not an option in Ohio, leaving them few options.

Another audience member pointed out that they believe that number of people who walk to work in the community out of financial need is much higher than city officials think. Particularly with low-end wages remaining low, many of these workers cannot afford the starting costs of obtaining a car.

Bruce Jeffers acknowledged that this remains a challenge in our community and that the taxi service alone was not a solution to these issues, particularly with many of the work opportunities not being located in close proximity to housing that the workers at these facilities could afford. Another audience member expressed a desire for the university to increase its offerings beyond the current shuttle system which is limited and doesn’t fully serve the needs of low income university students.

**K-12 Education**
Several respondents discussed the need to increase the diversity and cultural education programs in our local schools. This includes current effort to increase the diversity of the teaching staff, but audience members and written responses called for the task force to partner more closely with BG City Schools. They suggested programs around discussions of stereotypes and racism, bullying, and education about non-Christianity based religions. They also suggested creating partnerships with BGSU that would help bring international students into the schools as mentors, student teachers, or interns to help increase the visibility of diverse populations.
Written respondents also voiced concerns that now that the voters had declined to pursue a single, unified elementary school, that diversity would continue to be unequal across our elementary schools. Crim, which draws students from the neighborhoods surrounding the University, encompasses much of the diversity in the district. This means that students attending Conneaut and Kenwood schools are not experiencing this same level of diversity until a later age, when they’ve already begun to form stereotypes, biases, and other ideas about people of diverse backgrounds.

Housing
There were three main areas of concern raised about housing. The first was the need to be more strategic in planning housing in relation to employment. Until transportation solutions are available, the distance between affordable housing units and job opportunities can be severely limiting. The second was the need for affordable and accessible housing for those with limited credit histories – both for immigrants and young people who have not yet established their credit. The final area of concern was ensuring that as affordable housing is built and developed, that safety standards are maintained and ensured by the city. The panel largely didn’t not address these concerns beyond acknowledging that they were indeed challenges and that many of them would be addressed as part of the Community Action Plan.

Public Safety and Policing
Several respondents raised concerns regarding the impact that policing policies have on how welcome immigrants and minorities feel in our community. With the current national climate around Immigrations and Customs Enforcement and the use of force by police departments against people of color, there was good deal of concern about needing to hear from BGPD regarding what they’re doing to be part of this effort.

There was a real desire for clarification of the BGPD’s policy regarding cooperation with Immigration and Customs Enforcement and Border Patrol. One respondent was quite concerned about practices used by these agencies and felt that it went against the values of our community to be party to these tactics.

Chief Hetrick spoke plainly about his experience with working with Border Patrol and Immigration and Customs Enforcement. He stated that during his over 20 years of time with BGPD, they had only interacted with these agencies twice, and only once in recent years. He stressed that the recent case had only gone to this level after a series of local interventions failed and it was only as a “last resort” option because in this case they felt the individual posed a serious threat to the community. He explained that prior to involving these agencies, they had
attempted to connect the individual to mental health services and to deal with these issues without resorting to that.

Chief Hetrick also stressed that BGPD had no desire to be part of immigration enforcement and that he wanted his department to keep their focus on public safety issues. The department has invested in training to help counteract bias and to help ensure that they are not engaging in profiling within the community. He wants all members of the community to have trust in his officers and to feel safe in reporting crimes to them.

Beatriz Maya said that she felt that Chief Hetrick had established a healthy relationship with La Conexión and the Latino community – listening to their concerns and responding and thanked him for his work.

There was still a lingering concern in the written responses that while they were happy to hear from the Chief regarding these policies, that more could be done to help ensure that the community at large is aware of the efforts and focus of the police.

**Viability**

Due to the current state of the immigration system, with the overall numbers of immigrants being granted access to the country, some respondents questioned how viable it is to expect to build our economy through attracting immigrants. They pointed out that the cost and hassle of sponsorship can be quite daunting.

In response, Christina pointed out that the international students at BGSU already present a ready and willing workforce. Most international students would like to remain in the country – but the challenge lies in bridging that gap. This is where developing the resources to help employers understand the process of sponsoring individuals will become key. Co-ops and internships can also help those international students connect with companies and employers helping motivate them to retain these individuals when they graduate if they understand how to go through the process.
ADDITIONAL RESOURCES

NETWORKS AND ORGANIZATIONS

Local/Regional:
Ohio Welcome Initiatives Network (OWIN)
Welcome Toledo/Lucas County
   www.weglobalnetwork.com/lucas-county-toledo
Global Detroit
   www.globaldetroit.com
Welcome Dayton
   www.welcomedayton.org
Global Cleveland
   www.globalcleveland.org

National Networks:
Welcoming America
   www.welcomingamerica.org
Welcoming Economies Network (WE)
   www.weglobalnetwork.org

Other resources:
State of Ohio Office of Opportunities for New Americans
   http://development.ohio.gov/newamericans
   http://ustogether.us

LITERATURE

- Welcoming Cities: Framing the Conversation. Written by Welcoming America
- What is a Welcoming City or County?
  https://www.welcomingamerica.org/programs/member-municipalities
- The Most Entrepreneurial group in America wasn’t born in America. Inc. Adam Bluestein 2016